

Orientation of Master Trainers on Teaching of Medical Ethics

Report of the Meeting
Dhaka, Bangladesh, 12-18 June 2010

SEA-HSD-339
Distribution: General

Orientation of Master Trainers on Teaching of Medical Ethics

*Report of the Meeting
Dhaka, Bangladesh, 12-18 June 2010*

© World Health Organization 2010

All rights reserved.

Requests for publications, or for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – can be obtained from Publishing and Sales, World Health Organization, Regional Office for South-East Asia, Indraprastha Estate, Mahatma Gandhi Marg, New Delhi 110 002, India (fax: +91 11 23370197; e-mail: publications@searo.who.int).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

This publication does not necessarily represent the decisions or policies of the World Health Organization.

Printed in India

Contents

	<i>Page</i>
1. Introduction	1
2. Background.....	1
3. Objectives of the meeting	3
3.1 General objective.....	3
3.2 Specific objectives.....	3
4. Expected outcome	3
4.1 Proceedings	3
5. Inaugural session	3
6. Recommendations for Member States	8
7. Recommendations for WHO.....	9
8. Closing session	9

Annexes

1. Agenda	10
2. List of participants	11
3. Welcome address by Dr Serguei Diorditsa, Acting WHO Representative to Bangladesh.....	14

1. Introduction

An Orientation of Master Trainers on Teaching of Medical Ethics was organized in Dhaka, Bangladesh from 14-18 June 2010. Sixteen master trainers from Bangladesh, Bhutan, Indonesia, Myanmar, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Thailand participated in the programme. In addition, there were two observers from Bangladesh who attended the orientation programme. These master trainers were senior faculty members of forensic medicine department and other relevant departments from premier private and public institutions in the above countries.

The orientation was preceded by a two-day preparatory meeting of facilitators organized at the same venue from 12-13 June 2010 with the participation of five international experts who were facilitators for the above orientation programme. The facilitators were from Bangladesh (1), Nepal (2), India (1) and Sri Lanka (1). During the preparatory meeting, the facilitators:

- Discussed and finalized the content and process of group work sessions.
- Discussed and finalized their own training sessions/presentations
- Identified roles of facilitators.
- Finalized day-wise programme for the orientation of master trainers (14-18 June 2010).

The agenda of the meeting and the list of participants are given in **Annexes 1 and 2** respectively.

2. Background

Medical councils are the regulatory bodies responsible for medical education and medical practice to ensure quality health care in the WHO South-East Asia Region. A Regional Network of Medical Councils in the SEA Region was established in 2006 with the aim of facilitating exchange of

information and resources, addressing common issues of concern including ethical practice and professionalism, quality of education and continuing medical education.

The first meeting of the Regional Network of Medical Councils was held in Colombo, Sri Lanka, in December 2007 which identified the need to develop a module on teaching of medical ethics for undergraduates as a priority activity.

In response, WHO developed a Module for the Teaching of Medical Ethics to Undergraduates through a consultative process. This module was approved for implementation at the Second Meeting of the Network of Medical Councils held in Chiang Mai, Thailand, in November 2008. This meeting also recommended the development of a handbook and a facilitators' guide for effective implementation of the module for the teaching of medical ethics.

In line with this recommendation, a handbook and facilitators' guide were developed by the WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia (WHO-SEARO) through a consultative process. These two documents were reviewed and finalized at an expert group meeting held in Dhaka, Bangladesh from 27-30 October 2009. The finalized documents were endorsed and approved by the Third Meeting of the Network of Medical Councils of the South-East Asia Region held in November 2009 in Kathmandu, Nepal. The above expert group meeting also suggested teaching of ethics in the Member States through orientation of master trainers using the ethics module, facilitators' guide and handbook of medical ethics.

The above orientation of master trainers on teaching of medical ethics is a pilot training programme which uses the ethics module, facilitators' guide and handbook of medical ethics as tools for teaching of ethics to medical undergraduates. More such orientation programmes are expected to be organized by the master trainers and the facilitators with support from their national governments and WHO to create a critical mass of trainers to provide further training in ethics teaching in their respective countries.

3. Objectives of the meeting

3.1 General objective

To improve teaching/learning of medical ethics in undergraduate medical education.

3.2 Specific objectives

- To orient the master trainers on the use of the ethics module and the facilitators' guide for ethics teaching.
- To equip the master trainers with desired training concepts and competency in ethics teaching.
- To facilitate preparation of teaching / learning materials.

4. Expected outcome

The orientation programme was aimed at orienting master trainers from Member States on the use of the ethics module, handbook of medical ethics and facilitators' guide for teaching ethics. The master trainers along with the facilitators were expected to take up the training of trainers in their respective countries in teaching of ethics to undergraduate medical students.

4.1 Proceedings

5. Inaugural session

The inaugural session was held on 14 June 2010 and Professor Tirath Das Dogra, Professor and Head of Department, Forensic Medicine, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi, India, was the chairperson for the inaugural session. Professor Shah Monir Hossain, Director General Health Services (DGHS), Bangladesh, was the Chief Guest.

Dr Serguei Diorditsa, Acting WHO Representative to Bangladesh, welcomed the participants on behalf of the WHO Representative Dr Duangvadee Sungkhobol. He briefed the participants regarding the work of WHO Bangladesh in the area of teaching of ethics in medical education.

Some of the initiatives taken by WHO Bangladesh and DGHS Bangladesh in the area of teaching of ethics include piloting the first WHO-SEARO Guidelines on Teaching Health Ethics, supporting the Bangladesh Medical & Dental Council (BMDC) and Centre for Medical Education (CME) in developing Modules for Teaching Health Ethics in Undergraduate Medical Education and a country-wide orientation programme for teachers of medical colleges. He reiterated that with such a background, it would be easy for Bangladesh to adapt the regional module and make the best use of it. He affirmed that WHO Bangladesh would continue to work with BMDC, CME and DGHS to support institutions in the successful implementation of the medical ethics module, as part of the continuous effort for improving quality of health professionals' education, as well as the quality and safety of health services.

Dr Muzaherul Huq, Regional Adviser, Human Resources for Health and Fellowships, WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia (WHO-SEARO) briefed the participants regarding the objectives of the orientation programme. He said that countries in the Region were faced with increasing medical litigation, changes in complexities in medical practice and growing concern of consumers and consumer courts. In response, WHO carried out a review of the situation in six countries of the SEA Region in 1996. On the recommendation of the network of medical councils of the Region, WHO also developed a module of teaching of medical ethics, a facilitators' guide and a handbook of medical ethics for teaching of medical ethics to medical undergraduates. The ethics module was expected to help medical graduates recognize ethical issues; understand the importance of being sensitive to ethical issues in clinical practice; develop the ability to effectively address the ethical concerns by taking decisions while managing patients and responsibilities towards the state and encourage conduct of ethical research.

He said that the ethics module, facilitators' guide and handbook of medical ethics could be used as tools for teaching of ethics in the subsequent orientation programmes to be held in the Member States.

Professor Shah Monir Hossain, Director General Health Services (DGHS), Bangladesh, in his inaugural address asserted that if ethics in medical practice was followed, it would solve a lot of problems. Due to patient load and irrational doctor-patient ratio, doctors were unable to put medical ethics into practice. He emphasized that medical ethics was very important and medical councils should play a very important role in ensuring practice of ethics in registration and accreditation. He said that the orientation programme would provide an opportunity to go through the modules developed by WHO-SEARO and use them for teaching of medical ethics in undergraduate medical teaching.

Dr T D Dogra, in his remarks mentioned that unimaginable empowerment of people has occurred during the last 65 years. Areas like genetic engineering had opened new frontiers and human/medical/scientific ethics had become highly relevant in the current times. In the current context when genetic manipulation had increased our capacities manifold, practicing restraint and adherence to medical ethics had become extremely necessary. He said that practice of medical ethics was very important to save human civilization and to have a peaceful society and long lasting civilization.

The opening session was followed by a plenary session in which Professor T D Dogra made a presentation on genesis and evolution of ethics and the role of teachers in promoting professional ethics. He briefed the participants regarding ethical principles, the need for ethics, morality, various theories related to morality, impact of world wars on ethics and ethical concepts in medicine. Regarding the role of teachers in promoting professional ethics, Dr Dogra briefed the participants on the teaching behaviours, impact of physical environment on learning, modes of learning in adults, student characteristics, essential components of student learning, learning and teaching process, motivation, role of the teacher in teaching ethics, the methodology to be adopted in teaching ethics, curriculum of ethics, assessment and evaluation.

This was followed by a presentation by Dr Buddhika Weerasundera who introduced the module on medical ethics. She briefed the participants about the objectives, use and the contents of the module.

Professor J P Agrawal, in his presentation on "Introduction of Handbook of Medical Ethics", briefed the participants on the contents of the handbook. Subsequently, the participants were divided into four groups

and each group was asked to work on a specific topic from the handbook and make a group presentation next day on the identified topic.

Day 2 commenced with presentations by each group on the specific topics from the handbook of medical ethics. This was followed by a presentation by Professor J P Agrawal on Principles of Adult Learning. During the interactive session, he described in brief the principles of learning followed by the principles of adult learning and the characteristics for conducting the sessions for adult participants. He said that learning should be constructive and not receptive; metacognition affects the use of knowledge and social and contextual factors influence learning. He further stated that adults learn if they are motivated for learning; they learn by doing with the focus on realistic problems; they like an informal learning environment and a variety of teaching methods. Based on the principles of adult learning, the characteristics for conducting sessions for adult participants were discussed.

This was followed by a presentation by Dr Zahedul Karim Ahmad on problem-based learning (PBL). He gave an overview of the various aspects of PBL and its applicability in teaching medical ethics at the undergraduate level. The techniques and advantages of PBL were actively discussed by the participants.

In his presentation on communication skills, Professor J P Agrawal said that some of the components in teaching/learning of medical ethics are based on good doctor-patient relationship; students need to have good communication with patients. An interactive session on types of communication skills highlighting its importance was delivered. Due emphasis was given to concepts of training in communication skills highlighting the essential ingredients of experiential learning of communication skills.

As learning skill is an important communication skill, a role play session was organized. Well intentional, detailed and descriptive feedback on listening skill was the focus.

Day 3 started with a presentation by Professor Zahedul Karim Ahmad on planning an educational session. A sample lesson plan was presented for discussion. There was a lot of interaction among the participants. Various queries on how to prepare the lesson plan were made by the participants who were later given group work to prepare their own lesson plans. The

presentation appeared to be fruitful as most of the participants were able to prepare and present their own lesson plans quite effectively.

In his presentation on Microteaching and Feedback, Professor Ramesh Adhikari briefed the participants regarding microteaching, its basic concepts, historical perspectives of microteaching, its advantages and uses, rules for microteaching, feedback process, teacher behaviour inventory (TBI) lesson planning, use of audio-visual aids and how to prepare for microteaching.

This was followed by a presentation on feedback skills by Professor J P Agrawal. Feedback skill being one of the most important skills for experiential learning especially learning of skills, the principles of receiving and giving feedback was discussed. It was highlighted that feedback should be constructive, concise, specific and action-oriented. There should be a typical "sandwich approach" to feedback in which critical remarks are layered between saying something positive at the beginning and at the end. The participants were oriented on how to communicate the feedback, how to learn effectively from feedback and the feedback process.

This was followed by group work wherein each of the participants selected a topic from the handbook of medical ethics and prepared a microteaching lesson plan.

Day 4 commenced and concluded with microteaching sessions by each of the participants followed by feedback.

Day 5 commenced with microteaching sessions by the remaining participants and was followed by plenary discussions on the following:

- (1) Feasibility of the use of materials on medical ethics.
- (2) Approaches to train the faculty members on medical ethics.
- (3) Steps in the implementation of the training programme.

To summarize, during the above five-day orientation, the participants were oriented on the following:

- Evolution of ethics
- Role of teachers in promoting professional ethics

- The module on medical ethics
- Facilitators' guide
- Handbook of medical ethics
- Principles of adult learning and how to learn better
- Problem-based learning
- Importance of communication skills and how to develop communication skills
- How to plan an educational/training session
- How to organize microteaching and sharing feedback
- How to develop a lesson plan on topics
- Assessment process and technique.

The participants worked in groups and made group presentations on selected topics from the handbook of medical ethics. They also worked individually and prepared individual presentations on selected topics.

The participants were given an opportunity to evaluate and provide feedback on each group's presentation and also each of the individual participant's teaching session/presentation. The feedback was most beneficial to help organize the teaching session with substantial improvements.

The participants felt that the module and the facilitators' guide were very useful in organizing teaching of medical ethics.

6. Recommendations for Member States

- (1) Teaching of ethics in medical schools should be made mandatory by the medical council.
- (2) The module should include legal aspects relevant to the respective countries.
- (3) Development of more case scenarios for teaching is essential to make it more interesting.

- (4) There is a need to include ethics not only for medical students but also for doctors during internship and for other allied health sciences too.

7. Recommendations for WHO

- (1) WHO should organize more training of master trainers
- (2) WHO should organize advocacy meetings with deans/principals, medical associations and medical councils

8. Closing session

In his closing remarks, Dr Muzaherul Huq thanked the participants for their active participation and quality deliberations and expressed satisfaction regarding the outcome of the orientation. He requested the facilitators and the master trainers to work together and organize orientation programmes in their respective countries to create a critical mass of master trainers for teaching of medical ethics in their respective countries.

Annex 1

Agenda

Preparatory Facilitators' Meeting (12-13 June 2010)

The facilitators will work together and develop the following for the orientation of Master trainers:-

- (1) Training programme using the Ethics Module, the Handbook and the Facilitators' Guide
- (2) Training methodology
- (3) Trainee assessment methods with tools

Orientation of Master trainers (14-18 June 2010)

- (1) Inaugural Session
- (2) Objectives by Dr Muzaherul Huq, Regional Adviser, Human Resources for Health and Fellowships
- (3) Introduction of participants
- (4) Presentation of the Module for Teaching of Medical Ethics
- (5) Brief Presentation on the use of Handbook of Medical Ethics for teaching Undergraduate Medical Students of South-East Asia Region
- (6) Orientation sessions on various topics of teaching of Medical Ethics as indicated in the SEAR Ethics Module, facilitators' guide and handbook of medical ethics.
- (7) Assessment of Trainees
- (8) Closing Session

Annex 2

List of participants

Master Trainers

Bangladesh

Professor Md. Mizanul Haque
Professor
Forensic Medicine Department
Dhaka Medical College
Dhaka, Bangladesh

Professor (Dr) Tazendra Chandra Dash
Professor
Forensic Medicine Department
Sir Salimullah Medical College
Dhaka, Bangladesh

Dr Abu Jamil Forhad
Professor
Shahid Mansur Ali Medical College
Uttara, Dhaka
Bangladesh

Bhutan

Mr Nima Sangay
Assistant Registrar
Bhutan Medical and Health Council
Thimphu, Bhutan

Dr Pakila Drukpa
Forensic Medicine Specialist
Jigme Dorji Wangchuk National Referral
Hospital
Thimphu, Bhutan

Indonesia

Dr Oktavinda Safitry
Head of Forensic Medicine Postgraduate
Study Program
Faculty of Medicine
University of Indonesia
Jakarta Pusat, Indonesia

Dr Arif Rahman Sadad
Coordinator- Education and Training
programme in Forensic and Medico legal
Department,
Faculty of Medicine,
Diponegoro University, and
Manager, Forensic and Medico legal Division,
Dr. Kariadi General Hospital
Semarang, Central of Java, Indonesia

Myanmar

Dr Win Kyi
Professor / Head
Department of Forensic Medicine
University of Medicine (2)
Yangon, Myanmar

Dr Aung Soe
Associate Professor / Head
Department of Forensic Medicine
University of Medicine
Magway, Myanmar

Nepal

Dr Nisha Keshary Bhatta
Additional Professor and Head
Department of Pediatrics and
Member Secretary of Institutional Ethical
Review Board
BP Koirala Institute of Health Sciences
Dharan, Nepal

Professor (Dr) Arjun Karki
Vice-chancellor
(Patan Academy of Health Sciences) and
Executive Member (Nepal Medical Council)
Kathmandu, Nepal

Dr Madhav Prasad Khanal
Associate Professor
Tribhuvan University
Institute of Medicine and
T.U. Teaching Hospital
Kathmandu, Nepal

Sri Lanka

Dr Clifford Perera
Senior Lecturer and Medico-legal Specialist
Department of Forensic Medicine
Faculty of Medicine
University of Ruhuna
Galle, Sri Lanka

Dr K Sunil Kumara
Consultant Judicial Medical Officer
Office of the JMO.
Colombo South Teaching Hospital
Kalubowila, Sri Lanka

Thailand

Dr Manoch Chockjamsai
Department of Forensic Science
Faculty of Medicine
Chiangmai University
Chiang Mai, Thailand

Dr Panuwat Chutivongse
Department of Forensic Science
Faculty of Medicine
Chulalongkorn University
Bangkok, Thailand

Facilitators

Bangladesh

Dr Zahedul Karim Ahmad
Professor
Forensic Medicine
Ibrahim Medical College
Dhaka, Bangladesh

India

Professor Tirath Das Dogra
Professor and Head of Department
Forensic Medicine
All India Institute of Medical Sciences
New Delhi, India

Nepal

Professor Ramesh Kant Adhikari
Professor in Child Health and Former Dean
Institute of Medicine
Tribhuvan University
Kathmandu, Nepal

Professor (Dr) Jagdish Prasad Agrawal
Executive Director
National Centre for Health Professions
Education
Institute of Medicine, Maharajgunj
Kathmandu, Nepal

Sri Lanka

Dr Buddhika Weerasundera
Senior Lecturer and Head of the Department
of Forensic, Medicine and Toxicology
Faculty of Medicine
University of Colombo
Colombo 8, Sri Lanka

Observers

Professor Md. Mostaque Rahim
Professor and Head
Department of Forensic Medicine
Rangpur Medical College
Dhaka, Bangladesh.

Dr Muhammad Zubaidur Rahman
Assistant Professor
Forensic Medicine
Dhaka Medical College
Dhaka, Bangladesh

WHO Secretariat

Dr Muzaherul Huq
Regional Adviser
Human Resources for Health and
Fellowships
Department of Health Systems Development
(HSD)
WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia
New Delhi, India

Mr Abdul Mazid Miah
Senior Secretary
Human Resources for Health (HRH) Unit
WHO Bangladesh
Dhaka, Bangladesh

Ms Y Ramani
Awards Assistant
Human Resources for Health and
Fellowships Unit
Department of Health Systems Development
(HSD)
WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia
New Delhi, India

Annex 3

Welcome address by Dr Serguei Diorditsa, Acting WHO Representative to Bangladesh

Respected Chairperson, honourable Chief Guest, WHO colleagues, distinguished participants, ladies and gentlemen,

It is my pleasure to greet you on behalf of Dr Duangvadee Sungkhobol, WHO Representative to Bangladesh, who could not join due to prior commitments and to welcome you to this “Orientation of Master Trainers on Teaching of Medical Ethics”. This meeting is a follow-up to the expert group meeting to review and finalize the Handbook and Facilitators’ Guide on Medical Ethics, which was also held in Dhaka in October last year. This orientation programme will enable countries of the Region to make use of the module for the Teaching of Medical Ethics to Undergraduates that was finalized in September 2008.

The need for ensuring ethical medical practice has been acknowledged since the inception of the medical profession. The call by Hippocrates to medical practitioners to “First Do No Harm” and asking them to live up to the pledges of the Hippocratic Oath have been central to medical professionalism. Globalization and the increasing commercialization of medical education and practice increases the necessity for intensive efforts to develop and implement holistic strategies to develop appropriate ethical decision-making skills among medical students and practitioners and apply them while facing ethical issues in health care.

Medical councils, as the regulatory bodies for medical education and medical practice, have a major role to play in promoting and supervising standards of medical education, and promoting ethical practice by medical professionals. WHO is glad to see the active engagement of the Network of Medical Councils of the South-East Asia Region in this initiative. We are sure that, in close collaboration with WHO country offices as well as with the related national authorities, the medical councils will carry this initiative forward.

Both WHO Bangladesh and DGHS have recognized earlier the necessity to take action in promoting ethical medical practice and in facilitating teaching health ethics in medical education. This includes supporting the piloting of the first WHO

SEARO Guidelines on Teaching Health Ethics. Following that, WHO Bangladesh, in 2007-2009, supported the Bangladesh Medical & Dental Council (BMDC) and the Centre for Medical Education (CME) in developing modules for Teaching Health Ethics in Undergraduate Medical Education which was approved by BMDC and circulated to all medical colleges for implementation. A country-wide orientation programme for teachers of medical colleges was implemented in collaboration with CME. This will make it easy for Bangladesh to adapt the regional module and make the best use of it.

WHO Bangladesh will continue working with BMDC, CME and DGHS to support institutions in the successful implementation of the medical ethics module, as part of the continuous effort for improving quality of health professionals' education, as well as the quality and safety of health services.

Ladies and gentlemen,

Today's training would not be possible without a very comprehensive plan to prepare and finalize the chain of many events such as:

- A module for teaching medical ethics to undergraduates was developed by the WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia (WHO-SEARO) in 2008 through a consultative process.
- This module was endorsed by the second meeting of the Network of Medical Councils of the South-East Asia Region held in Chiang Mai in November 2008.
- The Chiang Mai meeting recommended the development of a facilitators' guide. Subsequently, a facilitators' guide was developed by SEARO which was reviewed and finalized in the Expert Group Meeting held in Dhaka in October 2009.
- A training of master trainers in ethics teaching using the ethics module and the facilitators' guide is being organized by WHO-SEARO in Dhaka from 14-18 June 2010.
- As mentioned earlier, today those selected master trainers from Bangladesh, Bhutan, Indonesia, Myanmar, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Thailand are participating in this programme.
- These master trainers are senior faculty members of forensic medicine department and other relevant departments from premier private and public colleges in the Member States.

- Internationally reputed facilitators from the Region will be facilitating these master trainers on the use of the facilitators' guide for the teaching of medical ethics.
- These master trainers will organize national training programmes to train local trainers involved in teaching ethics in their respective countries.

I would like to conclude by wishing you all a successful training session. I thank the resource persons for their efforts in preparing and facilitating this important regional event. Your active participation will ensure intense and fruitful orientation, leading to fruitful outcomes that will contribute to ensuring ethical practice by medical doctors in your respective countries. Your sincere efforts at contributing to the success of this programme are deeply appreciated.

An Orientation of Master Trainers on Teaching of Medical Ethics was organized by the WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia (SEARO) in Dhaka, Bangladesh, on 14-18 June 2010. It was a pilot training programme organized on ethics teaching in which master trainers from Bangladesh, Bhutan, Indonesia, Myanmar, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Thailand participated. They were oriented on the teaching of medical ethics to medical undergraduates through the use of an ethics module, facilitators' guide and a handbook of medical ethics. The principal objective of the orientation was to improve standards of teaching and learning medical ethics in undergraduate medical education. The document provides a concise report of the proceedings.



**World Health
Organization**

Regional Office for South-East Asia
World Health House
Indraprastha Estate,
Mahatma Gandhi Marg,
New Delhi-110002, India
Website: www.searo.who.int



SEA-HSD-339